PHIL001. Introduction to Philosophy – Psychological & Biological Approaches to Personal Identity, 7/13/2011

Problem of Personal Identity = $_{Df}$ . Under what conditions is it the case that a person A at time  $t_1$  is the same person B at some later time  $t_2$ ?

## Group 1, pp.117–123: What is the Memory-Connected Theory of Personal Identity?

Characterize the Simple Memory Theory by filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if

Next, explain one problem with the Simple-Memory theory and then explain the Memory-Connected Theory of Personal Identity by (i) drawing a diagram on the board and (ii) filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if \_\_\_\_\_\_.

Using a diagram, illustrate what it means for A at t1 and B at t2 to be memory connected.

Next, imagine you are trying to sell a Memory-Transportation Device, a device that transfers the memories of A at t1 to B at t2. The people you are trying to sell the product to are most worried about whether your transportation device will preserve their identity.

- (1) According to the Memory-Connected theory, under what conditions is it safe to use the Memory-Transportation Device? That is, what sort of transformations can A at t1 undergo and still be B at t2?
- (2) According to the Memory-Connected theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B?

Finally, quickly review the objections to the memory-connected theory and prepare a defense of these objections.

## Group 2, pp.118–123: What are the objections to the Memory-Connected Theory and what is the Psychological Continuity Theory of Personal Identity?

First, quickly review the Memory-Connected Theory of Identity. Second, identify the objections to this theory. Finally, characterize the Psychological Continuity Theory of Personal Identity by (i) drawing a diagram on the board and (ii) filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if

What is meant by "the right kind of psychological continuity"? What sort of factors make up the "right kind of psychological continuity"? Why is this theory better than the memory theory?

Next, imagine you are trying to sell the Instantaneous Travel Device, a device that scans A's psychology at t1 in State College, destroys A's body, and then recreates B whose psychology is identical to A at t2 in New York. This device works instantaneously so that there are no breaks in psychological continuity, memory loss, or change in personality.

- (1) According to the Psychological-Continuity theory, under what conditions is it safe to use the Psychological-Continuity-Transportation Device? That is, what sort of transformations can A at t1 undergo and still be B at t2?
- (2) According to the Psychological-Continuity theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B?

Finally, quickly take a look at the objection on p.123 and consider how you might respond to this objection.

## Group 3, pp.123–131: What are the objections to the Psychological-Continuity Theory and what is the Biological Theory of Personal Identity?

First, quickly review the Psychological-Continuity Theory of Identity. Second, identify the objections to this theory (see p.123). Finally, characterize the Same Life Theory of Personal Identity by (i) drawing a diagram on the board and (ii) filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if

How is this theory superior to the Same Soul theory (see p.125–126)? Finally, try your best to articulate the objection to the Same-Life theory on pp.126–127. Draw a diagram on the board to illustrate this objection.

<sup>(1)</sup> According to the Same Life theory, under what conditions is it safe to use the Memory-Transportation Device? That is, what sort of transformations can A at t1 undergo and still be B at t2?

<sup>(2)</sup> According to the Same Life theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B?