PHIL001. Introduction to Philosophy – Physical & Soulful Approaches to Personal Identity, pp.111–117, 7/12/2011

Remember the question of personal identity:

Problem of Personal Identity = $_{Df.}$ Under what conditions is it the case that a person A at time t_1 is the same person B at some later time t_2 ?

Group 1, pp.111–113: What is the Same-Body theory of personal identity?

Characterize the Same-body theory by filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if ______.

Next, using the above theory, answer the following questions:

- (1) According to the Same-Body theory, under what conditions is it a good idea for A to use a transporter machine (a machine that dissembles A's parts and then reassembles them as B)?
- (2) According to the Same-Body theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B when A steps into a transporter machine, is dissembled, then reassembled as B?

Finally, explain the brain-transplant objection to the Same-Body Theory. Illustrate this objection by drawing a diagram on the board.

Also, consider this case: suppose A's body is scanned, vaporized, and then reconstructed with new material. Call this reconstructed individual is B. Suppose that there is B has all the memories of A, has physical appearance, is the same type of thing (e.g. human), and B behaves very similarly (if not exactly like) to A. According to the Same-Body theory, does A=B? According to you, does A=B?

Group 2, pp.113–114: What is the Same-Brain Theory of Personal Identity

Characterize the Same-brain theory by filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if

Next, using the above theory, answer the following questions:

- (1) According to the Same-Brain theory, under what conditions is it a good idea for A to use a transporter machine (a machine that dissembles A's parts and then reassembles them as B)?
- (2) According to the Same-Brain theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B when A steps into a transporter machine, is dissembled, then reassembled as B?

Finally, explain the two objections to the Same-Brain Theory (pp.113–114). Illustrate these objections by drawing a diagram on the board.

Also, consider this case: suppose A's body is scanned, vaporized, and then reconstructed with new material. However, suppose that A's brain is not destroyed and kept alive for a period of time. Now suppose that A's brain is put into a robotic body, made mostly of silicon and metal. Call this reconstructed individual is B. Suppose that there is B has all the memories of A and B behaves very similarly (if not exactly like) to A. According to the Same-Body theory, does A=B? According to you, does A=B?

Group 3, pp.115–117: What is the Soulful Approach to Personal Identity?

Characterize the Soulful theory by filling in the blank:

If A is a person at t1 and B is a person at t2, then B is the same person as A if and only if

Next, using the above theory, answer the following questions:

- (1) According to the Same-Brain theory, under what conditions is it a good idea for A to use a transporter machine (a machine that dissembles A's parts and then reassembles them as B)?
- (2) According to the Same-Brain theory, under what conditions is it the case that A=B when A steps into a transporter machine, is dissembled, then reassembled as B?

Finally, explain the three objections to the Same-Brain Theory (pp.113–114). Illustrate the third of these objections by drawing a diagram on the board.