

Handout 7.2: Criticisms of Thompson’s Analogies

Group #1. The Misunderstood Samaritan

First, read the parable of the Good Samaritan:

On one occasion an expert in the law stood up to test Jesus. “Teacher,” he asked, “what must I do to inherit eternal life?” “What is written in the Law?” he replied. “How do you read it?” He answered, “‘Love the Lord your God with all your heart and with all your soul and with all your strength and with all your mind’[a]; and, ‘Love your neighbor as yourself.’” “You have answered correctly,” Jesus replied. “Do this and you will live.” But he wanted to justify himself, so he asked Jesus, “And who is my neighbor?” In reply Jesus said: “A man was going down from Jerusalem to Jericho, when he was attacked by robbers. They stripped him of his clothes, beat him and went away, leaving him half dead. A priest happened to be going down the same road, and when he saw the man, he passed by on the other side. So too, a Levite, when he came to the place and saw him, passed by on the other side. But a Samaritan, as he traveled, came where the man was; and when he saw him, he took pity on him. He went to him and bandaged his wounds, pouring on oil and wine. Then he put the man on his own donkey, brought him to an inn and took care of him. The next day he took out two denarii and gave them to the innkeeper. ‘Look after him,’ he said, ‘and when I return, I will reimburse you for any extra expense you may have.’ “Which of these three do you think was a neighbor to the man who fell into the hands of robbers?” The expert in the law replied, “The one who had mercy on him.” Jesus told him, “Go and do likewise.” – Luke 10:25-37 (New International Version)

On, p.146, how is Thompson said to use the parable of the Good Samaritan in the abortion debate? Next, on p.150-151, explain Kaczor’s criticism of Thompson’s understanding of the Good Samaritan parable. Why is there even a reference to the Good Samaritan parable at all? Is this just an argument from religion?

Group #2. Bodily Integrity

Consider Thompson’s violinist analogy again (the relevant similarities & differences). In addition to a right to life, Kaczor thinks that we have a **right to bodily integrity**. How is the act of unplugging in the violinist case relevantly different from the act of abortion in the abortion case? Finally, are there any kinds of abortion that do not violate a human fetus’s right to bodily integrity?

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN VIOLINIST SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Violinist Scenario	Abortion Scenario

Group #3. Objection to the Burglar Analogy

In the Burglar case, opening the window is said to be analogous to having sex insofar as both play a role in the causal sequence that leads to the existence of the fetus. What are some *relevant* differences between the two cases.

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN BURGLAR SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Burglar Scenario	Abortion Scenario

Given the above differences, which one of the premises below does Kaczor’s objection address.

- P1: The Burglar Scenario and the Abortion Scenario are analogous
- P2: In the burglar scenario, it is morally permissible to remove the burglar from your home (and, if necessary, to use deadly force to do so).
- C: Therefore, it is morally permissible to remove the fetus from your body (and, if necessary, to use deadly force to do so).

Group #4. Boonin’s Response to the Burglar Scenario Objection

Boonin claims that someone can have a **right to life** but they do not have a **right to using our body**. Further, we can be responsible for someone’s existence but not responsible for their continued neediness. What does this mean? Illustrate it as best you can (pp.163). Second, articulate the objection to Boonin’s view in the first paragraph on p.164.

Group #5. A Second Objection to the Burglar Analogy

Explain the second objection to the Burglar Analogy (see pp.164-165)

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN BURGLAR SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Burglar Scenario	Abortion Scenario

Group #6. A Third Objection to the Burglar Analogy

Explain the third objection to the Burglar Analogy (see pp.165)

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN BURGLAR SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Burglar Scenario	Abortion Scenario