

Handout 7.1: Thompson's Analogies

Group #1

1. Violinist Analogy (pp.145-147)

First, what is the goal of Thompson's argument? Second, explain the violinist scenario as best you can (you don't need to explain how it relates to the abortion debate, just make sure we have a clear idea of what the scenario involves). Fill out the following table on the board:

SIMILARITIES BETWEEN VIOLINIST SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Violinist Scenario	Abortion Scenario

Group #2

1.2. The Violinist Analogy (pp.146-147)

Concisely present Thompson's violinist argument with Premises (P) and a conclusion (C). Write this argument on the board (focus on p.146).

- A1: Assume that the human fetus is a person.
- P1:
- P2:
- C: Therefore, in the abortion scenario, even if the human fetus is a person, ...

In the last paragraph of 7.1, Thompson raises an **objection**. State which premise is denied and articulate the objection.

Group #3

2. Burglar Analogy (pp.147-148)

First, explain the burglar scenario as best you can (you don't need to explain how it relates to the abortion debate, just make sure we have a clear idea of what the scenario involves). Fill out the following table on the board (Hint: there will be a lot of similarities with the :

SIMILARITIES BETWEEN BURGLAR SCENARIO & ABORTION SCENARIO	
Burglar Scenario	Abortion Scenario

Finally, explain the burglar argument as best you can by writing the following argument on the board

- A1: Assume that the human fetus is a person.
- P1: The burglar scenario and the abortion scenario are analogous (relevantly similar)
- P2:
- C: Therefore, in the abortion scenario, even if the human fetus is a person, ...

Group #4

Special Responsibilities to Children (pp.149-150)

Explain the objection that Thompson considers on p.149 concerning special responsibilities to children. First, explain this objection. Next, explain Thompson's response to this objection.